

for the Waste recycling review. The Chairman agreed to further discuss the matter with Professor Coggins when it was ready to hold public meetings in respect of its reports findings.

iv. The Panel noted that officers had received three replies from a request to supermarkets relating to their treatment of food waste protocols.

The Panel considered the issue relating to a letter from a grower's organisation that had been received in confidence and considered that the Minister of Transport and Technical Services should not have publicly referred to the letter.

The Panel agreed to write to organisations and other exporters for the criteria that they currently abided by in light of the changes to UK supermarket protocols.

Officers were directed to take the appropriate action.

v. The Panel considered issuing a statement in response to the Business Plan to the effect that the Business Planning process did not work. The Panel agreed that the Chairman was to prepare a report, or set of comments on the failures of the Business Planning process before 3rd September 2007. Members were encouraged to provide the Chairman with their comments for inclusion as soon as possible.

b) To Note Documents Received

The Panel noted and considered the Planning Department's Response to the EDAW report. It further noted that time constraints of current review commitments would not permit further investigation at this time.

The Panel noted a record of the Transport and Technical Services meeting, of the 3rd August 2007, which was held to assess political feeling regarding the future of Jersey's Taxis. Some minor amendments to the record were requested.

MR

All Members
& Chairman

EKW

3. Transcript: Meeting with Minister of Transport and Technical Services.

The Panel noted the transcript from a meeting held in private session with the Minister of Transport and Technical services to discuss composting issues.

The Panel recalled that the meeting was intended to be a Public Hearing, however due to technical problems with electronic mail prior to the Hearing; a Panel Member had been unaware of the hearing taking place. The Panel accepted apologies from Connétable Le Brun in this connexion.

The Panel discussed its number and noted that it could invite a fifth member to join. The Panel agreed that the Chairman should

Chairman

	<p>invite a fifth Member to join the Panel or advise the States that the Panel would remain at four and reduce its quorum to two.</p> <p>The Panel noted an amendment was required to page 21 of the transcript. 2,000 tonnes was to be corrected to read 20,000 tonnes and that the same amendment was required in the Panel report. Officers were directed to take the appropriate action to correct the figures.</p>	<p>MR</p>
	<p>4. Fact Finding Trip to Brussels</p> <p>The Panel considered and held in abeyance the proposed visit to Brussels on 18th and 19th September 2007, with the Minister for Planning and Environment to cover questions relating to energy, the environment, waste and accompanying legislation. The Panel agreed to delay the trip until spring 2008.</p> <p>The Officer was requested to advise Mr. Lamballais of its decision.</p>	<p>CLQ</p>
	<p>5. Air Quality Review</p> <p>The Panel considered the draft terms of reference and agreed that domestic fire emissions should be included.</p> <p>The Panel agreed that an advisor would be required for this review and noted the CV's of two potential individuals. Officers were directed to prepare the necessary documentation so that advisors could attend hearings and assist with the evaluation of evidence and providing a technical report.</p> <p>The Panel considered two possible advisors and agreed to invite both to interview on the 6th September 2007 or the 21st as available, and to ask for their comments on the terms of reference. It further considered it beneficial to the review if the advisor were to be present at the initial hearings. The Panel noted that one of the advisors had local connections and matched the review criteria very closely.</p> <p>Officers were directed to take appropriate action to facilitate the interviews.</p> <p>The Panel considered the requirement for independent air quality monitoring as part of the review and agreed that the issue should be discussed with the potential advisors. The Panel noted that a monitoring study may take a full twelve months in order to cover seasonal variations. The Panel would discuss any concerns relating to impartiality should the monitoring study be undertaken by the appointed advisor.</p> <p>The Panel endorsed the suggested timescale for the review to be six months to a year depending on the need for an air quality monitoring study and subject to the terms of reference remaining as they currently were.</p> <p>The Panel agreed to announce the review by press release once the Chairmen's Committee had been advised of the scope and terms of reference.</p> <p>Officers were directed to take the appropriate action.</p>	<p>CLQ</p> <p>CLQ</p> <p>CLQ</p>

	<p>6. Design of Homes</p> <p>The Panel received a draft of the Design of Homes Report for consideration. The Panel noted that the final report would be completed for presentation to the States by 11th September 2007; the final draft would be available at the next meeting and would be printed on the following day.</p> <p>The Panel considered the inclusion of a letter from the Société Jersiaise previously agreed to be of importance to the review</p> <p>The Panel agreed to pay particular attention to the recommendations and to express agreement to the contents of the report at its earliest convenience.</p>	
	<p>7. Waste Review</p> <p>The Panel considered the Waste Recycling poster and proposed some amendments. The Panel agreed that it should be printed on recycled or sustainable sourced paper.</p> <p>Officers were directed to take appropriate action.</p> <p>The Panel agreed that a public hearing with the Minister for Environment and Planning was to be arranged for 6pm on 17th September 2007, at the Town Hall.</p> <p>Officers were directed to formally invite the Minister.</p> <p>The Chairman agreed to provide the previous response to the Ministers comments as an outline for areas of questioning which should be forwarded to the Minister five working days prior to the meeting.</p> <p>The Panel noted that questions for the hearing would be considered at the Panel meeting of 6th September 2007.</p> <p>The Panel agreed that the public hearing should be followed by a public meeting to facilitate questions from the public. It further agreed that a quarter page advert in the JEP was required for three issues and that all States Members would be invited to attend. The Panel agreed to invite schools to submit questions to the Panel for inclusion in the Public Meeting. It further agreed that Connétable Crowcroft would chair the public meeting.</p> <p>Officers were directed to take the appropriate action.</p> <p>The Panel noted that the mobile recording equipment was required and may require technical support. The Panel authorised the necessary expenditure for the review, to include room hire and transcription.</p> <p>Officers were directed to take the appropriate action.</p>	<p>MR</p> <p>CLQ</p> <p>MR</p> <p>SC</p> <p>Officers</p> <p>CLQ</p>
	<p>8. Items for Noting</p> <p>a) The Panel noted its current financial position.</p>	

	<p>b) The Panel noted the letter dated 9th August 2007 from Planning and Building Services relating to proposed sites of archaeological interest. It further noted that the submission date for comments was 1st October 2007 and agreed to defer consideration until the Panel meeting of 6th September 2007.</p>	
	<p>9. Information required for the Chairmen's Committee</p> <p>a) The Panel noted the Panel Position report as submitted to the Chairmen's Committee agenda for the meeting of 7th September 2007.</p> <p>b) Connétable Crowcroft was nominated to be profiled for the forthcoming Scrutiny newsletter. The Panel considered the nomination and agreed that Connétable Crowcroft would be the profiled Member for this issue.</p>	
	<p>10. Water Quality in St Aubin's Bay</p> <p>The Panel considered water quality monitoring results from 1994 to 2007 and noted that monitoring at First Tower appeared to cease in 2004. It further noted that the monitoring performed was to record levels of certain bacteria (coliforms and streptococci) only and that many failures had been recorded. The Panel further noted that no monitoring of nutrient levels in effluent was available.</p> <p>The Panel considered Jersey's international responsibilities through the various Directives to which Jersey has signed. Deputy Le Claire agreed to forward details of the Directives to the officers.</p> <p>The Panel agreed that a public meeting was to be arranged for the 21st September 2007 with the Ministers for Transport & Technical Services, Environment & Planning and Health to discuss the issue of water quality. It further agreed to invite the Chairman of the Health, Social Security and Housing Scrutiny Panel and a representative from Environmental Health.</p> <p>Officers were directed to take appropriate action</p>	<p>PLC</p> <p>CLQ</p>
	<p>11. AOB</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Town Park and the plan and future development of La Collette were considered as possible topics for future reviews. <p>The Panel recalled that a Panel officer was seconded to another Panel for 4 months to assist with the Phone Mast review. The Panel agreed to request additional officer time to facilitate an additional review at the Chairmen's Committee meeting of the 7th September 2007.</p> <p>The Panel agreed to provide bullet points of the areas of</p>	

concern regarding the Plan and future development of La Collette. Officers were directed to draft a scope, terms of reference and source possible advisors following receipt of the bullet points.

- The Panel recalled that the Transport Plan was still outstanding. The Panel considered writing to the Minister or posing a question in the States to ascertain the expected date of publication.
- The Panel considered attendance at the Sustainable City 3 day Conference in Malmo, 12th – 14th September 2007. It further considered that the conference was on a States week. The Panel agreed that the conference was of significant importance to Panel Business. It further agreed that up to 2 Members should attend the full conference with an officer. The Panel Chairman would attend following the States sitting. The Panel agreed that the Minister was to be invited to attend and that guided site visits would be arranged following the conference.

In addition the Panel agreed that the advisor to the Design of Homes review was to be invited to attend. In return for payment of his travel and conference expenses, the advisor was expected to provide the Panel with a report of the conference and associated site visits and if necessary to recommend developments to visit.

CLQ

Officers were directed to take appropriate action.

The Panel agreed that the publication of the Design of Homes report was not to be delayed in order to incorporate information gained from the conference, but an addendum was to be issued to include these findings. The Panel further agreed that the conference would be a useful fact finding visit to develop the terms of reference and scope for its Design of Homes II Review relating to Waterfront developments.

- The Panel considered the need of Panel Members to have a form of official identification. The Chairman agreed to approach the Greffier of the States to this effect.
- The Panel noted the intention of Connétable Crowcroft to propose an amendment to the Business Plan pertaining to the Town Park Plan to relocate car parking spaces.
- The Panel noted that Connétable Crowcroft intended to write to the Minister for Planning and Environment to call for a Public Inquiry into the proposed new energy to waste incinerator.
- The Panel noted that the Parish of St Helier had sought legal assistance to ensure quality of life for residents of the Havre des Pas area following concerns over airborne

	<p>particles and odour from the composting site at La Collette. Connétable Crowcroft requested permission for information within the transcript of the composting meeting with Transport and Technical Services [Item 3] to be released to the lawyer for information purposes. The Panel recalled that this transcript had not been made public at the Minister's request. The Panel advised that permission should be sought from the Minister if the contents of the transcript were to be used.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Panel received a booklet published by the Centre for Public Scrutiny pertaining to the scrutiny of local government finance and supported the concept of providing training for States members and officers in respect of scrutinizing business plans and budgets. The Panel requested that the Privileges and Procedures Committee be provided with a copy of the booklet for its information. 	<p>CLQ/KTF</p>
	<p>12. Future Meetings</p> <p>The Panel noted that the next meeting was scheduled for 9:30 am, 6th September 2007 in La Capelain room.</p>	

Signed

Date:

.....

Chairman
Environnement Scrutiny Panel